

**Intellectual Freedom Questioned:  
Challenges to Library Resources and Policies in Publicly Funded Canadian Libraries in  
2012**

Alvin M Schrader and Donna Bowman\*

July 2013

In 2012, for the first time in seven years of annual surveys of Canadian libraries, reports of DVDs outnumbered books in the formats of library materials targeted for removal or reclassification on the grounds of objectionable or unacceptable content.

Over half (56%) of all 73 challenges targeted DVDs, including one movie trailer, while only 38% were to books. Three challenges were to sound recordings, and one was to a poster entitled the “Reluctant Reader's Bill of Rights” that was displayed in the children’s department of a library on the grounds that it might “encourage youth to go against their parents’ wishes and read books they have been instructed not to read.”. While it may be premature to declare a new trend in the nature of library holdings and policies being targeted, the film-to-book ratio of challenges was the opposite of previous years. In 2011, for example, DVDs accounted for 40% of all challenges and books for 53%.

Adult works predominated in both DVD and book formats challenged in 2012. Of the DVDs targeted, adult titles (adult, “R,” and unrated) accounted for two-thirds of items and policies (26 challenges) and children’s titles (“PG,” “PG13,” “14A,” and unrated) for one-third (15 challenges). Of the books targeted, adult non-fiction titles again outnumbered children’s, accounting for 11 challenges compared to only four for children. Two challenges were reported to adult fiction titles and eight to children’s fiction, comics, and picture books.

The 2008 Czech computer-animated film “Goat Story,” directed by Jan Tománek (released in English in 2010), was challenged four times, more than any other work in 2012, on the grounds of offensive language and for being age inappropriate. In three of the four challenges, no change was made to the title’s placement with the children’s DVD collection,

while in the fourth it was reclassified to adult DVDs, even though the rating was “PG13” (“PG14A” according to the Motion Picture Association of America (MPAA), a non-governmental U.S. trade group).

There were also three challenges in 2012 to a 2009 gay-themed film (2011 DVD release) entitled “I Love You Phillip Morris,” based on Steve McVicker’s biographical *I Love You Phillip Morris: A True Story of Life, Love and Prison Breaks*, directed by Glenn Ficarra and John Requa and starring Jim Carrey and Ewan McGregor. Two challengers called for its outright removal from the library, on the grounds of homosexuality, sexual explicitness, and being age inappropriate, while the third wanted a higher movie rating (the Ontario Film Review Board rated it “14A,” but the MPAA rating was “R”). The film also prompted two objections to library access policies, one challenging a library’s unrestricted lending policy for movies rated “14A”; and the other calling for staff screening and rejection of all “offensive,” “disgusting,” “obscene,” or “sexually explicit” material that might be accessed by children, on the argument that “the public library system should contain material that upholds the values and moral strong points of our society to preserve it and improve it” and that certain material “is not in the public's best interest nor should it be so readily available.”

Several other films were also challenged in previous annual surveys on the grounds of homosexuality: the television mini-series (in DVD format) “Angels in America,” directed by Mike Nichols and starring Meryl Streep; “Brazil,” directed by Terry Gilliam and starring Robert De Niro; “The Girl Who Played with Fire,” directed by Daniel Alfredson and starring Noomi Rapace; and “Brüno,” directed by Larry Charles and starring Sacha Baron Cohen as a gay Austrian fashion journalist (although the complainant did not explicitly cite homosexuality among the several reasons given to justify removal from the library).

Previous annual surveys also reported frequent challenges to gay-themed books and magazines, particularly children’s picture books, but for the first time in seven years, no challenges were reported to same-sex picture books or magazine titles in 2012. In contrast, challenges were reported four years in a row 2006-2009 to *And Tango Makes Three*, by Justin Richardson and Peter Parnell. *The Sissy Duckling*, by Harvey Fierstein, was challenged in 2011, *Uncle Bobby's Wedding*, by Sarah S. Brannen, in 2010, and *King and King*, by Linda de Haan, and *My Princess Boy*, by Cheryl Kilodavis, in other surveys. In 2010 the LGBTQ weekly newspaper *Xtra! West* was also challenged. There was, however, one challenge in 2012 to a gay-

themed collection of erotic stories entitled *Hard and Fast*, by Sean Wolfe, for being sexually explicit and pornographic; the challenge was initiated by a self-identified gay man who said he enjoyed gay erotica and pornography but did not think it should be funded by taxpayers' money.

Also challenged three times in 2012, as age inappropriate for the children's section of the library, was Jason d'Aquino's illustrated book *Circus ABC*, a view subsequently endorsed by staff who reclassified it into adult non-fiction. And there were two challenges to the "R" rated DVD "Hobo with a Shotgun," directed and edited by Jason Eisener, on the grounds of violence. "Hobo" was also targeted in 2011.

Only one series of works was challenged in 2012, a season of six episodes of a British television comedy series, "Little Britain USA." (A challenged series is counted as the total number of individual titles.) In contrast, four series were challenged the previous year: the Jaime Hernandez titles in the *Love and Rockets* series of graphic novels; Philip Pullman's trilogy *His Dark Materials*; one season of four episodes in the ITV series "Trial and Retribution"; and one season of nine episodes of "The War Years," volume 2, in "The Adventures of the Young Indiana Jones" television series. Various series were also reported in earlier surveys: Pullman's *His Dark Materials* trilogy; the *Harry Potter* movie series of seven titles; Charlaine Harris's series of 10 novels entitled *The Southern Vampire Mysteries*, challenged four times in one year in the same library; *Negima! Magister Negi Magi*, by Ken Akamatsu, a manga series of 29 titles known in Japan as *Magical Teacher Negima!*; Cecily von Ziegesar's series of 15 titles, *Gossip Girl*, the inspiration for the "Gossip Girl" teen drama television series; and the Dark Horse manga series of 14 titles based on four of the *Star Wars* movies.

The *Annual Challenges Survey* has been conducted since 2006 by the Intellectual Freedom Advisory Committee (IFAC) of the Canadian Library Association, with a view to shedding light on the nature and outcome of challenges to library materials and policies that are experienced by publicly funded libraries across Canada in each calendar year. A challenge to library resources is an attempt to remove or restrict materials based on objection(s) by a person or group, in order to prevent or limit access. A policy challenge is an attempt to change normal access standards for library resources or services.

The 73 challenges reported in the 2012 survey occurred in 14 public libraries in three provinces. In 2011, 32 libraries in six provinces documented 101 challenges, with all major

sectors of publicly funded Canadian libraries represented – public, school, and post-secondary libraries; however, public libraries experienced 90% of the challenges that year.

Altogether, the 2012 survey revealed a total of 148 reasons for resource and policy challenges, on average 2 reasons for each case, which represents somewhat fewer reasons than the year before, when the average was 2.6 reasons per challenge.

More important than these and other statistics, however, are the ideas behind the challenges and the motivations behind the ideas. As in previous years, the reasons that complainants gave for challenging library materials and policies in 2012 were typically multifaceted and complex. For example, the grounds offered for challenges to Jason D’Aquino’s *Circus ABC* were racism, sexism, nudity, “creepiness,” and being age inappropriate, with “Africans depicted as circus freaks.” The plethora of grounds justifying a challenge in 2010 to *Jihad and Genocide*, by Richard L. Rubenstein, shows just how complex the ideas and motivations of complainants can be: “anti-ethnicity, insensitivity, inaccuracy, political viewpoint, and hate.” Still another example in the same year was a many-pronged challenge to *NOW Magazine* for “nudity, explicit sexuality, anti-family, drugs/drug use, offensive language, and age inappropriate.” And not perhaps as multifaceted but equally as complex, in 2012, a patron expressed a concern about the word “poop” in a picture book, claiming that, in their family, “they do not poop.” As the library staff member reported in the survey, “I simply had a chat with her about other people having the right to discuss poop with their families and the need for us to have a wide variety of materials and topics available to provide access to all expressions of intellectual activity.”

Four major reasons accounted for two-thirds of all challenges to library resources and policies in 2012: age inappropriate, which was mentioned 42 times; sexually explicit, 23 times; violence, 16 times, and offensive language, also 16 times. The 2011 survey showed the same four major reasons, but they were ranked differently: violence, sexually explicit, age inappropriate, and offensive language. There were 13 complaints in 2012 about racism in library materials, including three alleging negative depictions of Islam, nine complaints about nudity, eight about insensitivity, and seven about sexism. Of the challenges for nudity, one was an objection to the cover picture of Harry Hamlin’s autobiographical book, *Full Frontal Nudity: The Making of an Accidental Actor*. Four or fewer complaints were reported on the grounds of inaccuracy, religious

viewpoint, sexual predation, sex education, homosexuality, pornography, hate, and political viewpoint.

As in earlier surveys, the vast majority of concerns (77%) in 2012 were initiated by patrons (56 challenges) and another 12% by patrons self-identified as parents or guardians (9 challenges). Library staff, also patrons, initiated seven challenges in 2012, more than in any previous survey, and one complainant was a library patron in grade seven. Just over half of challengers called for removal of materials from libraries, while the remainder requested relocation of titles to adult collections. Four requested warning labels.

Not all of the concerns expressed by complainants were about new or recent titles, and not all were initiated by critics at one end of the political and ideological spectrum. The romantic comedy “That Touch of Mink,” directed by Delbert Mann and starring Cary Grant and Doris Day, was released in 1962 and challenged for misogyny. Similarly, “Woyzeck,” a movie about a famous murder case in 1836 that was directed by Werner Herzog and starred Klaus Kinski and Eva Mattes, was released in 1979 and also challenged for misogyny, in both content and DVD cover art.

More recently released titles that were targeted in 2012 include the 2009 drama “Precious: Based on the Novel “Push” by Sapphire,” directed by Lee Daniels and starring Gabourey Sidibe, Mo’Nique, and Paula Patton, which was challenged for “depiction of toddlers being abused, physically and sexually, finding images graphically disturbing.” The 2009 war-themed children’s picture book *G.I. Joe: The Rise of Cobra*, by Donald Capone, was challenged on the grounds it portrayed excessive violence for preschool children, with illustrations of men holding guns and other weapons. And the 2010 children’s fantasy novel *Luminaria*, by Jackie Morris, was targeted for being “littered with grammatical errors and hate-based.”

Of the 73 challenges to resources and policies documented in the 2012 survey, 62 were to individual titles and 11 were to related library policies. In 2012, for the second year in a row, a whole genre of library resources, adult DVDs, particularly horror films with “graphically violent images on their covers,” was challenged. (Whole genre challenges are counted in the survey as library policy challenges.) The complainant noted the DVDs were shelved within easy sightlines of children near the library circulation checkout area. Staff rearranged the DVD display stands to face away from that area. The “whole genre” challenge reported the year before was of a different magnitude, however, involving a request to remove “all graphic novels” from the

library's collection, on the grounds of explicit sexuality and violence, and singling out the 16 titles authored or illustrated by Jaime Hernandez in the *Love and Rockets* series, as mentioned above.

In 2012, a total of 84% of all challenges resulted in no change to the status of library holdings or policies, while another 8% of individual titles were reclassified and relocated to adult collections. Titles in four challenges were removed from library collections. One challenge was resolved with a content warning label; and one resulted in referral of the work to a publisher for review of accuracy. Only one of the eleven challenges to library policies resulted in a change. Most challenges were resolved quickly, even the same day or generally within a month.

Nine of the eleven policy challenges were linked to previously unsuccessful attempts to persuade libraries to remove items from collections, to change age-based lending conditions for DVDs, books, or comics, to modify movie ratings (whether official or unofficial), or to affix a content warning label. Challenged policies are listed in the appendix of challenged titles and policies, below.

It should be noted that the *Annual Challenges Survey* sponsored by the Canadian Library Association is voluntary, and hence the self-reports of challenges reported to the Committee represent only a small fraction of all challenges that occur during any calendar year. The American Library Association (ALA) estimates that for every challenge reported to them, there are as many as 4 or 5 others that go unreported ("Frequently Challenged Books," Office for Intellectual Freedom, on ALA's website, <http://www.ala.org/advocacy/banned/frequentlychallenged>). A small recent survey of U.S. libraries, asking about challenges that were reported to ALA and those that went unreported, corroborates these estimates (<http://librarianinblack.net/librarianinblack/2011/03/bookchallenges.html>). This under-reportage is no doubt greater in Canada, as the reporting mechanism is of more recent origin.

CLA President Pilar Martinez observed: "As a fundamental value to librarianship and a right in Canada's free and democratic society, intellectual freedom continues to be a critical area of advocacy for libraries and those who support libraries. CLA promotes the right of all people in Canada to share and explore different ideas and to have access to all beliefs and opinions without restriction. Indeed, libraries play a vital role in promoting and safeguarding intellectual freedom.

I wish to express my thanks to those who participated in the 2012 survey and strongly urge everyone to report this year's challenges in the 2013 survey."

The *Annual Challenges Survey* is now in its seventh year (conducted bilingually since 2009). The Canadian survey was inspired by two precursors, the Edmonton Public Library's challenged materials spreadsheet, and the confidential database maintained since 1990 by the American Library Association (ALA). ALA's online challenge reporting form can be found at <http://www.ala.org/ala/issuesadvocacy/banned/challengeslibrarymaterials/challengereporting/onlinechallengeform/index.cfm>. The form can also be printed as a pdf.

The goals of CLA's *Annual Challenges Survey* are to document objections to materials and policies in publicly-funded Canadian libraries with a view to informing the Association's policy and advocacy work for intellectual freedom. An innovation in the Canadian survey approach, since 2007, has been the inclusion of questions about challenges experienced by libraries to those policies affecting intellectual freedom in relation to resources and services; in 2012 a major review of format categories resulted in deletion of superseded technologies such as film strips and microforms.

The Committee encourages all librarians and library administrators in all publicly funded library sectors to participate in future surveys if they experience resource or policy challenges. Many large urban public libraries do not at present contribute data, even though there is a strong probability that the majority of them experience one or more challenges every year. Libraries in the survey served a wide continuum of municipal populations, from fewer than 20,000 people to more than 1 million. Frequency of challenges also varied widely, ranging from 1 to 18, with a median of 3.5 per reporting library. One library serving 100,000 residents reported three challenges; libraries serving 200,000 people reported two, six, and 18, respectively; libraries serving upwards of 1 million reported one, four, six, and 18, respectively; and one library serving around 50,000 reported eight. Equally, it is hard to believe that no school libraries across the entire country experienced challenges in 2012. As an example of public accountability and institutional transparency, Committee Convenor Alvin Schrader strongly endorses the practice by Toronto Public Library of releasing an annual report of collection challenges ("Library loathe to throw the book at disputed items," *Toronto Star*, June 29, 2013, p. GT3).

We want to reiterate, as we have in previous reports, that institutions are not identified in any way in public documents or reports. To underscore this commitment, CLA Executive

Council accepted a policy recommendation from the IFAC in 2011 that the names of institutions and municipalities identified in the *Annual Challenges Survey* will not be disclosed. Identifying data are collected for statistical purposes, verification of authenticity, and follow-up with reporting agencies if data elements are unclear. Permissible geographic and jurisdictional disclosures are as follows: province or territory; type of institution (school, post-secondary, public, etc.); and, type of complainant.

Survey results are widely shared with the CLA membership, other library workers and advocates, the Freedom of Expression Committee of the Book and Periodical Council and the annual *Freedom to Read Week* publication, the Office of Intellectual Freedom of the American Library Association (ALA OIF), and the Freedom of Access to Information and Freedom of Expression Committee of the International Federation of Library Associations and Institutions (IFLA FAIFE). Check their websites for reports.

Public access is available since 2011 to the complete database of challenged titles and policies for each of the seven survey years, eventually through the CLA website but until then inquiries and requests for access may be directed to IFAC Convenor Alvin M. Schrader at [alvin.schrader@ualberta.ca](mailto:alvin.schrader@ualberta.ca).

*\* Alvin M. Schrader and Donna Bowman are colleagues on the Canadian Library Association's Intellectual Freedom Advisory Committee.*

**List of Challenges to Resources and Policies  
Reported by Publicly-Funded Canadian Libraries, 2012**

Challenges are listed alphabetically, categorized by number of challenges per item. Note that slightly corrected bibliographic data are recorded here from what was originally supplied by library officials who contributed to the 2012 Survey.

Series – 1 challenge:

“Little Britain USA,” DVD (TV series of 6 episodes)  
- reasons: insensitivity; sexually explicit; offensive language

Individual items – 4 challenges:

“Goat Story,” computer-animated film, directed by Jan Tománek  
- reasons: offensive language; age inappropriate

Individual items – 3 challenges each:

*Circus ABC*, illustrated book, by Jason d’Aquino  
- reasons: racism; sexism; nudity; age inappropriate  
“I Love You Phillip Morris,” DVD, directed by Glenn Ficarra and John Requa, starring Jim Carrey and Ewan McGregor  
- reasons: homosexuality; sexually explicit; age inappropriate

Individual items – 2 challenges:

“Hobo with a Shotgun,” DVD, directed and edited by Jason Eisener  
- reasons: violence

Individual items – 1 challenge each:

*Amazing You! Getting Smart About Your Private Parts*, by Gail Saltz, illustrated by Lynne Cravath  
- reasons; sex education; nudity; age inappropriate  
“Bethenny’s Skinnygirl Workout,” DVD  
- reasons: insensitivity; sexism  
“Caligula: The Unrated Edition,” DVD, directed by Tinto Brass and Bob Guccione, starring Malcolm McDowell and Peter O’Toole  
- reasons: nudity; sexually explicit; age inappropriate  
*Callous Disregard: Autism and Vaccines–The Truth Behind a Tragedy*, by Andrew J. Wakefield  
- reasons: inaccuracy  
*Cool Pro-Wrestling Facts*, by Angie Peterson Kaelberer  
- reasons: violence; age inappropriate  
“Coraline,” DVD, directed by Henry Selick, starring Dakota Fanning, Teri Hatcher, and Jennifer Saunders  
- reasons: age inappropriate  
“Date Rape: A Violation of Trust,” DVD, produced by Films Media Group  
- reasons: racism  
*Diary of a Submissive: A Modern True Tale of Sexual Awakening*, by Sophie Morgan

- reasons: sexually explicit
- “Disney’s A Christmas Carol,” DVD
- reasons: age inappropriate
- Do Not Open*, by John Farndon
- reasons: age inappropriate
- “Dragon Ball Z: Bojack Unbound,” DVD
- reasons: violence; age inappropriate
- Encyclopedia of the African Diaspora*, by Carole Boyce Davies
- reasons: inaccuracy
- “Fast Food Nation,” DVD, directed by Richard Linklater
- reasons: sexually explicit; offensive language; age inappropriate
- “Feast of Love,” DVD, directed by Robert Benton, starring Morgan Freeman, Greg Kinnear, and Radha Mitchell
- reasons: sexually explicit; age inappropriate
- Fifty Shades of Grey*, by E.L. James
- reasons: age inappropriate
- The Flying Dutchman and Other Folktales from the Netherlands*, by Theo Medere
- reasons: age inappropriate
- Full Frontal Nudity: The Making of an Accidental Actor*, by Harry Hamlin
- reasons: nudity
- G.I. Joe: The Rise of Cobra*, by Donald Capone
- reasons: violence; age inappropriate
- Hard and Fast*, by Sean Wolfe
- reasons: sexually explicit; pornographic
- iHorror: Demon Hunter*, by Steve Skidmore and Steve Barlow, illustrated by Paul Davidson
- reasons: age inappropriate
- “The Little Blue Doggy: Songs by Lionel Daunais,” performed by Michelle Campagne and family
- reasons: violence; age inappropriate
- “Lost Book of Nostradamus,” DVD (TV)
- reasons: anti-ethnicity; racism; religious viewpoint
- Mon Petit Lapin*, by Claire Freedman
- reasons: offensive language; age inappropriate
- Luminaria*, by Jackie Morris
- reasons: hate
- “Nostradamus 2012,” DVD (TV)
- reasons: anti-ethnicity; racism; religious viewpoint
- On Becoming Baby Wise*, by Gary Ezzo
- reasons: inaccuracy
- “Overexposed,” CD, by Maroon 5
- reasons: offensive language
- The Politically Incorrect Guide to Islam and the Crusades*, by Robert Spencer
- reasons: anti-ethnicity; political viewpoint; religious viewpoint
- “Precious: Based on the Novel "Push" by Sapphire,” DVD, directed by Lee Daniels, starring Gabourey Sidibe, Mo’Nique, and Paula Patton
- reasons: violence; sexually explicit; sexual predation

- “Raid on Entebbe,” DVD trailer for an adult film  
 - reasons: sexually explicit; violence; age inappropriate
- “Reluctant Reader’s Bill of Rights,” poster  
 - reasons: age inappropriate
- Simple Times: Crafts for Poor People*, by Amy Sedaris  
 - reasons: [other]
- “The Snowtown Murders,” DVD, directed by John Kurzel  
 - reasons: violence
- “Teenage Dream,” CD, by Katy Perry  
 - reasons: age inappropriate; sexually explicit
- “That Touch of Mink,” DVD, directed by Delbert Mann, starring Cary Grant and Doris Day  
 - reasons: sexism; violence
- Tintin in the Congo*, by Hergé  
 - reasons: racism, age inappropriate
- “Tyrannosaur,” DVD, directed by Paddy Considine  
 - reasons: nudity; sexually explicit; violence
- Understanding Nutrition*, by Elanor Noss Whitney and Sharon Rady Rolfes  
 - reasons: anti-ethnicity; inaccuracy; racism
- “The Violin,” DVD, directed by Francisco Vargas  
 - reasons: violence
- Les Voleurs de Yaourts*, by Emmanuel Guibet and Joann Sfar  
 - reasons: offensive language; age inappropriate
- “The Woman,” DVD, directed by Lucky McKee  
 - reasons: sexism; nudity; sexually explicit; violence
- What’s Happening to My Body?* [subtitle unknown], by Lynda Madaras  
 - reasons: age inappropriate
- “Woyzeck,” DVD, directed by Werner Herzog, starring Klaus Kinski and Eva Mattes  
 - reasons: sexism; violence; age inappropriate
- [title and author unknown]  
 - reasons: offensive language

### Policy challenges:

- Policy of unfiltered Internet access for children
- Policy of not labelling DVDs in conjunction with “14A” movie ratings – linked to the challenged DVD “Fast Food Nation”
- Policies in two libraries on DVD ratings – linked to the challenged DVDs “Feast of Love” and “Coraline”
- Policies in four libraries of not restricting borrowing by age of DVDs rated “R,” adult, “14A,” – linked to the challenged DVDs “Caligula: The Unrated Version,” “I Love You Phillip Morris” (two libraries), and to a trailer in the DVD “Raid on Entebbe”
- Policies in two libraries of not restricting borrowing by age of adult materials – linked to the challenged *Fifty Shades of Grey* and the challenged comic book “Tintin in the Congo,” a title also targeted in 2011.
- Policy of displaying adult DVDs, particularly horror films with “graphically violent images on their covers” within easy sightlines of children near the library circulation checkout area

## List of Challenges to Resources and Policies Reported by Publicly-Funded Canadian Libraries, 2012

	Material type	Bibliographic info/Policy title	Reason and reason details	Who made complaint?	Type of Library	Final response and details	Prov/ Terr	Dates of challenge & resolution
1	Book/Textbook [children's picture book]	G.I. Joe: The Rise of Cobra by Donald Capone	Violence Age inappropriate The book was challenged because it was perceived to be too violent for preschool children. The challenger asked for the book to be moved from the Easy picture books (preschool to grade 2) to the Juvenile picture books (grade 3 to grade 6). The book is based on the popular G.I. Joe toys and movies. It is war themed and features illustrations of men holding guns and other weapons.	Parent/guardian Library staff member – the challenger is a part-time library staff member, as well as a parent who uses the library with her small children.	Public	Material retained. The book is clearly written for a preschool-grade two audience (large font, simple words and sentences, etc.). I explained to the challenger that many young boys and girls are G.I. Joe fans and that this item might be a good choice for those children.	AB	August 2012
2	Book/Textbook [children's non-fiction]	Cool Pro-Wrestling Facts by Angie Peterson Kaelberer. Part of the "Cool Sports Facts" series, this book describes the sport of pro-wrestling	Violence Age inappropriate The challenger felt that this item was too violent for young children and asked that it be moved from Easy Non-Fiction (preschool to grade 2) to Juvenile Non-Fiction (grade 3 to grade 6). Page 9 shows a photograph of a professional wrestler hitting his opponent with a chair. The caption reads "Cool Props. A folding chair isn't just for sitting. It also comes in handy against opponents during a match!" The challenger felt that this set a bad example for young children.	Parent/guardian Library staff member – the challenge was initiated by a part-time staff member who is also a parent of young children.	Public	Material retained. I explained that this book was clearly written for a preschool audience.	AB	August 2012
3	Book/Textbook [children's non-fiction]	Amazing You! Getting Smart About Your Private Parts by Dr. Gail Saltz, illustrated by Lynne Cravath. The book describes itself as "a first guide to body awareness for preschoolers". It describes and illustrates male and female genitalia and reproduction.	Sex education Nudity Age inappropriate The challenger felt that this book was not appropriate for young children. She asked that it be moved from Easy Non-Fiction to the Parenting Resources shelf.	Parent/guardian Library staff member – the challenge was initiated by a part-time library staff member who is also a parent to young children.	Public	Material retained. The item was not moved. The book is science-based and the cartoon illustrations are anatomically correct. The book is intended to teach preschoolers about their private parts.	AB	November 2012
4	Film/DVD [not rated kids' movie]	Dragon Ball Z: Bojack Unbound by FUNimation Productions	Violence Age inappropriate The challenger writes: "The age rating on the back is too low" "Very violent series. Not for children under 14." The patron felt that this film was too violent to be in the Juvenile section of the library.	Patron A patron completed our "Request for Reconsideration of Material" form. However the form was incomplete.	Public	Material retained. As it was unclear from the incomplete form if the patron had viewed our copy of the work, it was retained. I checked with other staff who had seen the film and they assured me that the edited version (which we have) is far less violent than the original. I suspect that our patron did not watch our copy, but knew of the original series from elsewhere.	AB	October 2012
5	Book/Textbook [illustrated book – author is an artist/illustrator]	Circus ABC by Jason D'Aquino	Racism Sexism Nudity Age inappropriate We had a few different individuals complain about this	Patron Parent/guardian Library staff member In December, the	Public	Material relocated/reclassified. After much research and lengthy discussion with senior management, it was decided to move the book to adult non-fiction. We had checked WorldCat for other copies (this	AB	December 2012 Resolved January 2013

			<p>item for various reasons. The staff member's note reads: "I would not want my children to see this. I find it offensive for nudity, creepiness. Describes itself as wicked, gross, and macabre...maybe in adult (not YA) art or G.N." The patron's form reads: "Racist and sexist depictions - not appropriate for children (nudity and Africans depicted as "circus freaks"). I feel it doesn't belong in the kid's area, that's all." "Thought it was a book of ABCs. It has nudity on the first page - totally unexpected. Yes, it is beautiful, but NOT for children." "Move it to [adult] where it can be appreciated appropriately."</p>	<p>book was left in my inbox by a staff member with an anonymous post-it note, reading "not suitable for kids". Because this was a vague and informal complaint, I re-shelved the book. A few days later, a part-time staff member left another, more detailed note asking it to be moved to the adult section. In mid-January, a patron filled out a "Request for Reconsideration of Material" form.</p>		<p>appears to be the only copy in the province's public libraries) and found it to be exclusively housed in adult non-fiction in other collections. We also agreed that some of the book's vocabulary (i.e., Zoological Conglomerations, Coney, Keeler) and themes indicated an older intended audience.</p>		
8	Policy	Library's internet access policy for children	<p>[Age inappropriate] [Other/sexual predation] Our library's internet access policy for children was challenged after a speaker on internet safety visited some local schools. Some parents felt that we should install internet filters on our public access computers to protect children from internet predators. There were a few articles in our local newspaper.</p>	<p>Patron Parent/guardian There was no particular complaint in this case. There were comments made about our library's lack of filters in social media. Some parents visiting the library asked about filters.</p>	Public	<p>Policy retained. We tried to educate the public about internet safety when using library computers. We also talked with many concerned parents about why filters are ineffective and inappropriate for a public library, and why parental involvement is a better way to protect children.</p>	AB	January 2012
9	Film/DVD [R-rated movie]	Precious, based on the novel Push, a novel by Sapphire	<p>Violence [Sexually explicit] [Other/sexual predation] Patron was concerned about depiction of toddlers being abused, physically and sexually, finding images graphically disturbing; patron wanted item removed, and implied a label was desirable</p>	Patron	Public	<p>Material retained. The selection of the dvd was in line with our collection policy, had been well reviewed both critically and in popular culture; the item was not labelled, relocated or removed.</p>	ON	April, 2012; Resolved May 12, 2012
10	Book/Textbook [adult non-fiction]	On Becoming Baby Wise by Gary Ezzo	<p>Inaccuracy Patron felt the content of the book was inaccurate and if the advice was followed could lead to infant dehydration and/or failure to thrive in infants including possible death. Patron wanted a warning label attached</p>	Patron	Public	<p>Material removed. Based on our collection policy the criteria for non-fiction selection is purpose/importance; authority/reputation and accuracy. As the reputation of Baby Wise in the medical community appeared to be largely negative</p>	ON	June 26, 2012 Resolved July 3, 2012

						with few supports on the author's authority on the subject and lack of scientific evidence, taken together with the item's contradiction of the feeding guidelines presented by various Canadian health organizations, we withdrew the title.		
1 1	Book/Textbook [adult non-fiction]	Understanding Nutrition by Eleanor Noss Whitney and Sharon Rady Rolfes, 1993	Anti-ethnicity Inaccuracy Racism The person felt the text book inappropriately portrayed and stereotyped people of different ethnic origin as inferior.	Library staff member	Public	Other [Material removed] The book was deleted as being outdated (it was 19 years old).	ON	August 27, 2012 Resolved August 27, 2012
1 2	Film/DVD [adult/not rated movie]	That Touch of Mink directed by Delbert Mann. Classic film starring Cary Grant, first released in 1962	Sexism Violence Objection to jocular dialogue of male lead re "whacking" girlfriend because she refuses to have sex with him. Remark not funny or appropriate; made viewer "feel sick & astounded that was even thought of as a joke back then."	Patron female viewer	Public	Material retained. Film features significant stars of mid 20th C American cinema; has won several awards including Golden Globe for best comedy.	BC	April 10, 2012; Resolved April 23, 2012
1 3	Film/DVD horror movie [adult, rated R]	The Woman, directed by Lucky McKee (2011)	Sexism Nudity Sexually explicit Violence Viewer objected to physical abuse, rape & torture scene - violence against women. "Degrades women"; should be removed due to "content of violence against women."	Patron female viewer	Public	Material retained. Although disturbing, the film has garnered critical acclaim; some film critics consider the director to be a radical feminist and the film has be[e]n interpreted as a feminist parable. catalogue record does note violence, disturbing behavior, graphic nudity, strong language.	BC	July 3, 2012; Resolved July 12, 2012
1 4	Film/DVD [family movie/PG 13]	Goat Story directed by Jan Tomanek, Phase 4 films. Rated PG in Canada, rated 14A in the US. Currently shelved with the juvenile DVDs.	Offensive language Age inappropriate Although the film contains nudity, sexism, Satanism, and drugs/drug use, the only formal complaints received have indicated that the work is not suitable for children and has offensive language. Patron partially completed the "Request for Reconsideration of Material" form. Includes the statement: "movie has a lot of adult humour and content including inappropriate language - not suitable for young children."	Patron Library staff member[s] At least two staff members have commented they think this film is not suitable for children. One patron was prompted to file a formal complaint, but did not complete the form.	Public	Material retained. After watching the film myself, I'm confused about who the intended audience is. I found the rating of PG to be accurate. Although the film is animated, it does contain more mature concepts (such as the goat getting drunk, female characters have outrageously huge breasts, the devil hangs around and tries to get people to sell their souls, etc.) and should be viewed with the caregiver's permission and/or supervision.	AB	September 2012
1 7	Film/DVD [adult, R-rated]	Caligula: the unrated edition, written by Gore Vidal, produced by Guccione and Franco Rossellini, directed by Tinto Brass. Malcolm McDowell (Actor), Peter O'Toole (Actor), Tinto Brass (Director), Bob Guccione (Director), 1980	Nudity Sexually explicit [Age inappropriate] Inappropriate for viewing by children.	Patron	Public	Material retained. Restricted movie. Explained circulation procedures for restricted movies.	ON	January 2012

1 8	Policy on R-rated DVD circulation	Linked to challenge to Caligula DVD above	Nudity Sexually explicit [Age inappropriate] Inappropriate for viewing by children.	Patron	Public	[Policy retained] Restricted movie. Explained circulation procedures for restricted movies.	ON	January 2012
1 9	Film/DVD [adult, R-rated in U.S., 14A in Canada, fictionalized movie]	Fast Food Nation [DVD] written by Eric Schlosser & Richard Linklater, produced by Malcolm McLaren & Jeremy Thomas, directed by Richard Linklater	Sexually explicit Offensive language [Age inappropriate] Inappropriate for viewing by children. Requested additional warning label, in conjunction with the 14A rating and description.	Patron	Public	Material retained. Retained in adult collection without an additional warning label.	ON	May 2012
2 0	Policy	Movie access policy related to challenge of Fast Food Nation DVD above	Sexually explicit Offensive language [Age inappropriate] Inappropriate for viewing by children. Requested additional warning label, in conjunction with the 14A rating and description.	Patron	Public	[Policy retained] DVD Retained in adult collection without an additional warning label.	ON	May 2012
2 1	Film/DVD [adult, rated 14A]	Feast of Love [DVD], GreeneStreet Films, Lakeshore Entertainment, Revelations Entertainment, produced by Gary Lucchesi, Tom Rosenberg 7 Richard S. Wright, screenplay by Allison Burnett, directed by Robert Benton	Sexually explicit [Age inappropriate] Challenged rating of movie, 14A versus restricted.	Patron	Public	Material retained. Rating of movie retained, as per Canadian Home Video Rating system.	ON	June 2012

								June 2012
2 2	Policy	Movie access policy related to challenge of Feast of Love DVD	Sexually explicit [Age inappropriate] Challenged rating of movie, 14A versus restricted.	Patron	Public	[Policy retained] Rating of movie retained, as per Canadian Home Video Rating system.	ON	
2 3	Book/Textbook [adult non-fiction]	Full Frontal Nudity: The Making of an Accidental Actor by Harry Hamlin	Nudity Inappropriate picture on book jacket [naked young boy with subtitle masking genitals]	Patron	Public	Material retained.	ON	September 2012
2 4	Film/DVD [PG-rated, family movie]	Goat Story [DVD], Phase 4 Films & Art and Animation Studio and Epic Pictures Group, directed by Jan Tománek	Age inappropriate Animated movie not appropriate for viewing by young children.	Patron	Public	Material relocated/reclassified. Moved from children's DVD collection to adult DVD collection, as per as adult themes and imagery and classification in other public libraries.	ON	March 2012

2 5	Film/DVD – TV series of 6 episodes [adult humour]	Little Britain USA [DVD], Home Box Office, 19 Entertainment	Insensitivity Sexually explicit Offensive language Library should not own this DVD title.	Patron	Public	Material retained. Material retained in adult section of DVD collection.	ON	July 2012
3 1	Film/DVD [adult exercise video]	Bethenny's Skinnygirl Workout [DVD]	Insensitivity [Sexism] Term "skinnygirl" is insensitive and potentially damaging to girls' body image. Library should not own DVD.	Patron	Public	Material retained. DVD retained in adult DVD collection.	ON	May 2012
3 2	CD/Sound recording [pop/rock]	Overexposed [compact disc], Maroon 5	Offensive language Parental Advisory warning label missing from CD cover regarding offensive language.	Patron	Public	Material retained. Missing Parental Advisory warning label added to cover.	ON	August 2012
3 3	Film/DVD [adult/ Rated R movie]	Hobo with a Shotgun [DVD], Alliance Films, a Rhombus Media/Whizbang Films production, a Yer Dead film, produced by Niv Fichman, Frank Siracusa & Rob Cotterill, written by John Davies, directed & edited by Jason Eisener	Violence Library should not own DVD.	Patron	Public	Material retained. DVD retained in adult DVD collection.	ON	March 2012
3 4	Film/DVD [adult/ Rated R movie]	Hobo with a Shotgun [DVD], Alliance Films, a Rhombus Media/Whizbang Films production, a Yer Dead film, produced by Niv Fichman, Frank Siracusa & Rob Cotterill, written by John Davies, directed & edited by Jason Eisener	Violence Library should not own DVD.	Patron	Public	Material retained. DVD retained in adult DVD collection.	ON	May 2012.
3 5	[Children's] Graphic novel/ Comic/Manga	iHorror: Demon Hunter by Steve Barlow & Steve Skidmore, illustrated by Paul Davidson	Age inappropriate Cover pictures (front and back). Content not appropriate for children. Patron expressed concern about the cover and the appropriateness of the content for children. Their recommendation was to remove the title from the children's section of the Library.	Patron	Public	Material retained. This title, and others in the series iHorror, are recommended by the publisher for children ages nine and up, which is considered suitable for the children's section of the library. The language, short passages and use of illustration are appropriate for children in grades four and up. The iHorror series, as well as other series written by the authors, are geared to reluctant readers and employ many strategies to attract children that might not otherwise attempt reading a novel. Included in these strategies are the interactive nature of the "choose your ending" novel, use of mythology and the artwork on the cover and within the novel. These elements, while not appropriate for all readers, are very appealing to the reluctant reader, particularly boys. The [...] Library strives to provide material for all readers regardless of skill or interest. The library recognizes the value the title Demon Hunters may have in motivating reluctant juvenile readers and will continue to shelve it	AB	December 17, 2011 Resolved January 4, 2012

						and similar titles in the children's collection.		
3 6	Film/DVD [actually, Other/film trailer]	Raid on Entebbe [actually, a trailer on the DVD version of this film, for an adult movie]	[Sexually explicit] [Violence] [Age inappropriate] "Within the main trailers of the main menu I found an ad for a porn film, the acting of ritual murders, and that it was available though my library. It was only the one trailer, but in the wrong hands it could be influential in a negative manner."	Patron	Public	Material retained. The movie is included in the Library's collection as it was nominated for and received several awards and is based on a significant historic event. The Library purchased this movie DVD for the main movie content rather than for the trailers, which are unknown at the time of purchase. The trailers that are included with the film are purely at the discretion of the producer of the DVD. The viewer does not need to watch the trailers, as the PLAY button is available immediately on the first screen. This version of the film is the only one currently available for us to purchase. Your comments included a concern that the content of the trailer could end up in the "wrong hands". This movie is housed in the adult section of the Library's collections. The policy of the Library is to provide young customers with access to all of our collections, with the stipulation that parents and guardians are expected to take responsibility for what their children read, view, and listen to. This responsibility is accepted by parents when they authorize a child's borrower's card.	AB	February 21, 2012 Resolved: March 12, 2012
3 7	Library circulation policy for adult materials	Linked to Raid on Entebbe DVD trailer challenge above	[Sexually explicit] [Violence] [Age inappropriate] "Within the main trailers of the main menu I found an ad for a porn film, the acting of ritual murders, and that it was available though my library. It was only the one trailer, but in the wrong hands it could be influential in a negative manner."	Patron	Public	[Policy retained] The movie is included in the Library's collection as it was nominated for and received several awards and is based on a significant historic event. The Library purchased this movie DVD for the main movie content rather than for the trailers, which are unknown at the time of purchase. The trailers that are included with the film are purely at the discretion of the producer of the DVD. The viewer does not need to watch the trailers, as the PLAY button is available immediately on the first screen. This version of the film is the only one currently available for us to purchase. Your comments included a concern that the content of the trailer could end up in the "wrong hands". This movie is housed in the adult section of the Library's collections. The policy of the Library is to provide young	AB	February 21, 2012 Resolved: March 12, 2012

						customers with access to all of our collections, with the stipulation that parents and guardians are expected to take responsibility for what their children read, view, and listen to. This responsibility is accepted by parents when they authorize a child's borrower's card.		
3 8	Book/Textbook [adult non-fiction]	Encyclopedia of the African Diaspora by Carole Boyce Davies [3 volumes]	Inaccuracy On page 9 there is history about Ethiopia. I found two ideas which are not true: 1) There is a section which states that Ethiopia was liberated from military rule in 1999. This is not true. It was in 1991 (May); 2) It also states that English is an official language in Ethiopia. Not English, but Amharic."	Patron	Public	Other – We have contacted the publisher, ABC-CLIO, and they will have the necessary corrections made in the electronic version of the book and in any additional print runs made of the book.	AB	January 27, 2012 Resolved: March 12, 2012
3 9	Film/DVD [adult / not rated, movie based on true story, rated R in U.S.]	I Love You Phillip Morris	Homosexuality Sexually explicit "The movie started with Jim Carrey singing in a church. He was at an early point obviously engaged in sexual intercourse with his wife. Within a few minutes he is having anal intercourse with a man. Followed by a critical car crash, found lying on the emergency gurney with two ambulance attendants putting him into the ambulance and he is yelling at the top of lungs, 'I'm gay, I'm gay'. At this point I turned the movie off." It is my belief that the public library system should contain material that upholds the values and moral strongpoints of our society to preserve it and improve it. This kind of material is not in the public's best interest nor should it be so readily available and therefore I would like to see it removed. I will also be contacting political figures about materials so readily on loan."	Patron	Public	Material retained. The film, directed by John Requa and starring Jim Carrey and Ewan McGregor, is included in the Library's collection as it is well reviewed in several sources. It received 3 stars out of a possible 5 in Leonard Maltin's Movie Guide and Roger Ebert assigned 3 ½ stars out of 5 to this movie. The storyline of this movie is based on the biographical book entitled I love you Phillip Morris: a true story of life, love and prison breaks by Steve McVicker, which is also included in the non-fiction collection of the Library. Your comments included a concern about the sexual content of this film, specifically the content dealing with homosexuality. The Library's Material Selection Policy mandates the purchase of library materials taking into account the diverse interests of all of the communities of [...] including content that reflects the interests of the gay and lesbian community. This movie title is clearly labeled with an R-rating which is indicated on the DVD container, the disc and within the information about the movie in the Library's catalogue. The catalogue indicates the suitability of this title as: "MPAA rating R for sexual content including strong dialogue, and language".	AB	March 27, 2012 Resolved: April 24, 2012
4 0	Book/Textbook [children's non- fiction]	Do Not Open by John Farndon	Age inappropriate "I feel it is inappropriate for children. Murder/ assassination/Hitler. Material is mature. Good for older generations – not children." Patron feels it should be recatalogued as an adult title.	Patron	Public	Material retained. The publisher, Dorling Kindersley, recommends this title for ages 8-17. As well, reviews in reviewing journals indicate that Do Not Open is appropriate for grades four and up. School Library Journal praises the title indicating that it contains "cleverly organized information" and has "perennial kid-appeal of	AB	May 16, 2012 Resolved: May 25, 2012

						topics". Do Not Open contains information about a variety of subjects, presented in a format that is very appealing to younger readers. Information is factual and presented in small text boxes with ample illustration. The content is indicated as being "spooky," "spine chilling" and "unthinkable" and therefore not appropriate for all readers. The [...] Library acknowledges your concerns about this title; however, Do Not Open does fall within the library guidelines for inclusion in the children's nonfiction collection and will remain in this collection.		
4 1	Policy [youth access policy] – linked to title challenge in same form	<p>You indicated concern with the broad access youth have to all materials in the Library's collection. In particular, your concern was with the ease that your daughter was able to place a hold on an adult fiction title, Fifty Shades of Grey; and that borrowing on youth cards should be restricted. The Library's youth card is distinguished from an adult card in that anyone under 18 must have parental or guardian consent. In agreeing to take responsibility for a youth card, the parent agrees to the responsibility of monitoring card use, including the suitability of materials borrowed. The expectation of parents and guardians to guide the reading choices of their children is stated in the Library Board's policy on Intellectual Freedom: "Responsibility for any restrictions on their children's use of library materials rests with parents and legal guardians. Selection will not be inhibited by the possibility that books may inadvertently come into the possession of children." As the guarantor of your daughter's library card you are able to access and monitor her card at any time, in branch or online. You might consider other options, such as setting up a Library Elf account to monitor all</p>	[Age inappropriate]	Parent/guardian	Public	<p>Policy retained.</p> <p>The Library's youth card is distinguished from an adult card in that anyone under 18 must have parental or guardian consent. In agreeing to take responsibility for a youth card, the parent agrees to the responsibility of monitoring card use, including the suitability of materials borrowed. The expectation of parents and guardians to guide the reading choices of their children is stated in the Library Board's policy on Intellectual Freedom: "Responsibility for any restrictions on their children's use of library materials rests with parents and legal guardians. Selection will not be inhibited by the possibility that books may inadvertently come into the possession of children." As the guarantor of your daughter's library card you are able to access and monitor her card at any time, in branch or online. You might consider other options, such as setting up a Library Elf account to monitor all of your family member's cards, or requesting personalized booklists for locating appropriate material.</p>	AB	June 12, 2012 Resolved: June 26, 2012

		of your family member's cards, or requesting personalized booklists for locating appropriate material.						
4 2	Book/Textbook [adult fiction] linked to policy challenge in same form	50 Shades of Grey, by E.L. James [Book 1 of the 50 Shades of Grey trilogy?]	[Age inappropriate] "I do not object to the book - I object to the fact that the system would allow a 15 year old girl to place these items on hold and sign them out. Yes, this book is a New York Times best seller, but it was written for a mature audience - not a teenager who is relatively innocent!"	Parent/guardian	Public	[Material retained] "As the guarantor of your daughter's library card you are able to access and monitor her card at any time, in branch or online. You might consider other options, such as setting up a Library Elf account to monitor all of your family member's cards, or requesting personalized booklists for locating appropriate material."	AB	June 12, 2012 Resolved: June 26, 2012
4 3	Film/DVD [adult movie based on true story, rated R in U.S.]	I Love You Phillip Morris	Sexually explicit Age inappropriate "This DUD [DVD] is unacceptable material to be on the shelves at [...] Library due to the EXPLICIT scenes of sexuality which CHILDREN have access to at a public library. It is the responsibility of the library to properly SCREEN materials and ensure the suitability for non-offensive material for library members. I have used [...] Library for many years. I am disgusted and appalled at [...] Library for allowing such obscene and disgusting material to be so easily accessed by our children. Please make the appropriate decision and REMOVE THIS MATERIAL!!"	Patron	Public	Material retained. The film, directed by John Requa and starring Jim Carrey and Ewan McGregor, is included in the Library's collection as it is well reviewed in several sources. It received 3 stars out of a possible 5 in Leonard Maltin's Movie Guide and Roger Ebert assigned 3 ½ stars out of 5 to this movie. The storyline of this movie is based on the biographical book entitled I love you Phillip Morris: a true story of life, love and prison breaks by Steve McVicker, which is also included in the non-fiction collection of the Library. You expressed concern over the explicit sexual nature of this movie and that it should not be accessible to children. This movie title is clearly labeled with an R-rating which is indicated on the DVD container, the disc and within the information about the movie in the Library's catalogue. This movie is catalogued as adult material and is housed in the adult section of the Library. The policy of the Library is to provide young customers with access to all of our collections, with the stipulation that parents and guardians take responsibility for what their children read, view, and listen to. This responsibility is accepted by parents when they authorize a child's borrower's card.	AB	August 22, 2012 Resolved: September 11, 2012
4 4	Policy [youth access policy]	Policy linked to challenge to DVD above	Sexually explicit Age inappropriate "This DUD [DVD] is unacceptable material to be on the shelves at [...] Library due to the EXPLICIT scenes of sexuality which CHILDREN have access to at a public library. It is the responsibility of the library to properly SCREEN materials and ensure the suitability for non-offensive material for library members. I have used [...] Library for many years. I am disgusted and appalled at [...] Library for allowing such obscene and disgusting material to be so easily accessed by our children. Please	Patron	Public	Policy retained. The film, directed by John Requa and starring Jim Carrey and Ewan McGregor, is included in the Library's collection as it is well reviewed in several sources. It received 3 stars out of a possible 5 in Leonard Maltin's Movie Guide and Roger Ebert assigned 3 ½ stars out of 5 to this movie. The storyline of this movie is based on the biographical book entitled I love you Phillip Morris: a true story of life, love and prison breaks by Steve McVicker, which is	AB	August 22, 2012 Resolved: September 11, 2012

			make the appropriate decision and REMOVE THIS MATERIAL!!"			also included in the non-fiction collection of the Library. You expressed concern over the explicit sexual nature of this movie and that it should not be accessible to children. This movie title is clearly labeled with an R-rating which is indicated on the DVD container, the disc and within the information about the movie in the Library's catalogue. This movie is catalogued as adult material and is housed in the adult section of the Library. The policy of the Library is to provide young customers with access to all of our collections, with the stipulation that parents and guardians take responsibility for what their children read, view, and listen to. This responsibility is accepted by parents when they authorize a child's borrower's card.		
4 5	Film/DVD [rated PG – family film]	Disney's A Christmas Carol	Age inappropriate "A scene regarding the ghost of Christmas Present. May be too scary for young children 2 - 7 years (approx.)." Your recommendation, as relayed to library staff, was to move the title to the teen DVD collection.	Parent/guardian	Public	Material retained. Disney's A Christmas Carol was widely reviewed and received mixed reviews for quality, but was generally recognized as a family film appropriate for ages nine and up. Occasional reviews noted that some children may find certain scenes frightening, echoing your concerns. The [...] Library recognizes its role in providing guidance to customers and to that end it categorizes material according to approximate age appropriateness. Material included in the children's collection that is marked J is considered appropriate for ages 7 to 12. This includes the audience for Disney's A Christmas Carol, and for this reason Disney's A Christmas Carol will not be moved from the J collection.	AB	August 30, 2012 Resolved: September 24, 2012
4 6	Film/DVD [adult/not rated]	The Snowtown Murders	Violence Other "This movie depicted graphic, prolonged scenes of human torture and child abuse. Animal abuse was also graphically depicted."	Patron	Public	Material retained. The storyline of this movie is based on the real, horrifying murders discovered in Snowtown, Australia, in 1999 as indicated in the library catalogue summary. Although the movie is not rated, the cover of the DVD case gives fair warning of the graphic, violent nature with quotes from several reviews including "genuinely disturbing" from a New York Times review and "profoundly disturbing" from Film Comment. The movie is also inspired by two books: Killing for Pleasure by Debi Marshall and The Snowtown Murders by Andrew McGarry. The film The Snowtown Murders, directed by Justin Kurzel, is included in the Library's collection as it is well reviewed in several sources and received several awards. Roger Ebert of the Chicago Sun	AB	October 17, 2012 Resolved: November 19, 2012

						Times assigned 3 ½ stars out of 5 to this movie. Awards include Best direction of a feature film from the Australian Directors Guild and several awards from the Australian Film Institute, including Best adapted screenplay and Best direction. The director also received Special Mentions during Critics Week at the Cannes Film Festival in 2011.		
4 7	Book/Textbook [adult non-fiction/humour]	Simple Times: Crafts for Poor People by Amy Sedaris	Other "This materials appears to be a craft book, but is more a parody. Should be recatalogued to a comedy book, not a craft book (at the very least). Removal if quoted paragraph [below] deemed offensive." Page 45, first paragraph: "What do an escaped convict, a lovable tramp, and an American Indian have in common? Aside from evading the law, the answer is crafting."	Patron	Public	Material retained. "Your specific concern is with the cataloguing of this book by the Library in the crafts section and that you would like to have it re-catalogued as a comedy book or removed from the collection. Recognizing that there is a certain satirical element to the content, this title has been classified as a book of handicrafts as the primary focus is the instructional content for various crafting activities with the secondary focus being humour. This is reflected in the assigned subject headings of – Handicraft and – Handicraft—Humor, in the Library's catalogue. We have checked the largest bibliographic cataloguing database used jointly by most libraries and the majority of other libraries that have this book in their holdings have also classified it in their handicrafts sections with the call number as 745.5."	AB	November 1, 2012 Resolved: November 29, 2012
4 8	[children's] Comic/Manga	Adventures of TinTin in the Congo by Herge.	Racism [Age inappropriate] The complainant stated that "The book contains racial stereotypes that I do not think are appropriate for children to read. I make this request now as TinTin is very popular right now (due to the movie) with a lot of children."	Patron Complainant works for the Family Services of [...]. He admitted to not having read the book.	Public	Material retained. Excerpt from the letter sent to the complainant. "The panel agrees with you that this title contains racial stereotypes which would not be tolerated in a piece of work published today. However, when this book was written, these attitudes were prevalent and considered commonplace. Herge was a product of his time and his work reflected that. However, the book was not written as a racist tract, nor did it propose to incite racial hatred. A library is home to many classic titles which are considered valuable because of their style, ideas or author but unfortunately contain stereotypes which belong to a bygone era. Children have a right equal to adults to access library collections and services. The library provides children with open access to adult collections under the same regulations that apply to adults [portion of the intellectual freedom statement quoted here]. As the library does not act "in loco parentis", it is the responsibility of the parent or guardian to	BC	March 9, 2012. Letter sent to the complainant on April 25, 2012 advising that the item would not be removed and why. No response was received from the complainant.

						monitor their child's use of library services and collections. With this in mind, reading some of this material with a child can be a good starting point for dialogue. Because this title is considered a children's work of fiction and is part of a classic series of comics, we have decided to retain the title in children's collection." Complainant did not respond further to the letter.		
49	Policy	[Youth access] policy linked to challenge to Tintin in the Congo	Racism [Age inappropriate] The complainant stated that "The book contains racial stereotypes that I do not think are appropriate for children to read. I make this request now as TinTin is very popular right now (due to the movie) with a lot of children."	Patron Complainant works for the Family Services of [...]. He admitted to not having read the book.	Public	[Policy retained] Excerpt from the letter sent to the complainant. "The panel agrees with you that this title contains racial stereotypes which would not be tolerated in a piece of work published today. However, when this book was written, these attitudes were prevalent and considered commonplace. Herge was a product of his time and his work reflected that. However, the book was not written as a racist tract, nor did it propose to incite racial hatred. A library is home to many classic titles which are considered valuable because of their style, ideas or author but unfortunately contain stereotypes which belong to a bygone era. Children have a right equal to adults to access library collections and services. The library provides children with open access to adult collections under the same regulations that apply to adults [portion of the intellectual freedom statement quoted here]. As the library does not act "in loco parentis", it is the responsibility of the parent or guardian to monitor their child's use of library services and collections. With this in mind, reading some of this material with a child can be a good starting point for dialogue. Because this title is considered a children's work of fiction and is part of a classic series of comics, we have decided to retain the title in children's collection." Complainant did not respond further to the letter.	BC	March 9, 2012. Letter sent to the complainant on April 25, 2012 advising that the item would not be removed and why. No response was received from the complainant.
50	Book/Textbook [adult non-fiction]	Callous Disregard: Autism and Vaccines: The Truth behind a Tragedy by Wakefield	Inaccuracy	[patron]	Public	Material retained. Retained on the strength of the Library's Materials Selection Policy.	AB	March 6, 2012 Resolved March 7, 2012
51	Film/DVD [adult, rated R in U.S.]	I Love You Philip Morris	Age inappropriate Patron was concerned that the 14A rating was not appropriate especially since the MPAA rating on the cover indicated an R rating in the US. He was concerned that because we don't restrict 14A movies in any way, young children may bring home the movie expecting a typical Jim Carrey comedy. He didn't feel it was suitable for general circulation and was asking to have it moved to a	Patron	Public	Material retained. We follow the classification system set out by the Ontario Film Review Board and only restrict circulation of 18A and R movies to those 18 and over. Movies rated by the OFRB as 14A are circulated openly. We do provide information for parents on movie ratings.	ON	December 22, 2011 (or thereabouts) Resolved January 26, 2012

			restricted rating. (We do restrict R and 18A movies as per Library Board policy.)					
5 2	Policy [linked to DVD I Love You Philip Morris]	Access policy to 14A movies	[age inappropriate]	Patron	Public	[Policy retained] We follow the classification system set out by the Ontario Film Review Board and only restrict circulation of 18A and R movies to those 18 and over. Movies rated by the OFRB as 14A are circulated openly. We do provide information for parents on movie ratings.	ON	December 22, 2011 (or thereabouts) Resolved January 26, 2012
5 3	Other – poster [children's]	Challenge was to a version of the Reluctant Reader's Bill of Rights poster we have hanging in our Children's department.	[age inappropriate] "May encourage youth to go against their parents' wishes and read books they have been instructed not to read."	Patron	Public	Material retained. A long letter was written explaining the intent of the statement "the right to read anything" and the role of the parent in their child's selection of materials. Patron was told that the poster would remain, but was given a Request for Reconsideration Form if she wanted to pursue it further. She did not. Later that summer, the same patron expressed a concern about the word "poop" in a story (sorry, I don't remember the story). She claimed that in their family, "they do not poop". I simply had a chat with her about other people having the right to discuss poop with their families and the need for us to have a wide variety of materials and topics available to provide access to all expressions of intellectual activity.	AB	March 2012 for both challenge and resolution
5 4	Book/Textbook [children']	Title and author forgotten	[Offensive language]	Patron	Public	[Material retained] Later that summer, the same patron expressed a concern about the word "poop" in a story (sorry, I don't remember the story). She claimed that in their family, "they do not poop". I simply had a chat with her about other people having the right to discuss poop with their families and the need for us to have a wide variety of materials and topics available to provide access to all expressions of intellectual activity.	AB	Summer 2012
5 5	Book/Textbook [described as "for all ages" in the book description on amazon.com]	The Flying Dutchman and Other Folktales from the Netherlands by Theo Meder	Age inappropriate The person felt the book should be changed to adult and three librarians reviewed the book, including the selector and agreed, so it was moved. Felt that due to the reason that there were a wide range of stories for all ages, that it should be moved to adult, rather than junior.	Parent/guardian	Public	Material relocated/reclassified – moved from JR to Adult.	BC	March 27, 2012. Resolved April 18, 2012.
5 6	Policy – Films/ DVDs [adult collection]	Adult DVDs that contain graphic horror and adult images	Age inappropriate [Violence] Adult DVDs containing graphically violent images on their covers (particularly horror films) should be removed from the view of children, near the checkout desk.	Patron	Public	Material relocated/reclassified. The branch re-arranged the display of Children DVDs and Adult so that Adult DVDs were not directly in view of the checkout desk. Physically, the DVDs remained in the same location, but they now face opposite directions.	ON	January 27, 2012
5	CD/Sound	The Little Blue Doggy: Songs by	Violence	Patron	Public	Material retained.	ON	July 7, 2012.

7	recording [Children's folk music]	Lionel Daunais, performed by Michelle Campagne and family	Age inappropriate Content isn't suitable for children. The folk song "Little Blue Doggy" promotes abuse and violent behaviour towards children. Children are not mature enough to recognize satirical and dark humour in this vein. Request to remove, or provide warning labels to parents about the abusive content in the story.			Music is by Juno-award-winning artists, with numerous library-approved reviews. Labelling the item is also impractical and misleading to the public.		Resolved July 9, 2012.
5 8	Book/Textbook [adult non-fiction]	Diary of a Submissive: A Modern True Tale of Sexual Awakening by Sophie Morgan	Sexually explicit Specifically, the customer objected to the book description as it appeared on our website. Troubling content for patron - Sexual dominance and submission.	Patron Sent email expressing outrage that the library had purchased this book to library board member and to his city council representative who in turn, forwarded it on to the Library Selection Team members	Public	Material retained. The selector replied to the customer explaining reasons why book was retained. A senior manager forwarded selectors letter to customer to library board members and city council representative. In our response, the customer was told that the library does not compose these [book] descriptions; that they are provided by the publisher and are the same on online booksellers' websites such as Amazon and Chapters.Indigo.	ON	October 22 or 23, 2012 Response sent to customer October 24, 2012
5 9	CD/Sound recording [pop music]	Teenage Dream by Katy Perry	Age inappropriate [Sexually explicit] Customer felt that CD did not belong [in] Young Adult collection but the Adult collection. Customer felt that exposure to the explicit lyrics and cover was inappropriate for a person of her age.	K-12 school student in gr 7	Public	Material retained. Material was kept in the Young Adult collection as it was in the YA collections at other locations.	ON	Dec 5, 2011 Resolved Feb 16, 2012
6 0	Film/DVD [unrated, adult Mexican film]	The Violin, starring Angel Tavira Maldonado, Gerardo Taracena, et al. (2008)]	Violence Customer felt we should affix a label to the DVD to notify viewers of violence in the film [involves Mexican militia fighters].	Patron	Public	Material retained [not labelled].	ON	June 27, 2012 Resolved June 28, 2012
6 1	Film/DVD [not rated, adult documentary]	Lost Book Of Nostradamus [History Channel, 2008]	Anti-ethnicity Racism Religious viewpoint Did not like how Muslims were depicted as terrorists in certain parts of the DVD.	Patron	Public	Material retained.	ON	August 14, 2012 Resolved August 28, 2012
6 2	Film/DVD [not rate, adult documentary]	Nostradamus 2012 [2009, A&E HOME VIDEO, History Television]	Anti-ethnicity Racism Religious viewpoint "You did not like the images of Muslims praying while the narrator is discussing terrorism and society collapsing."	Patron	Public	Material retained.	ON	August 14, 2012 Resolved August 28, 2012
6 3	Film/DVD Rated: Unrated/adult movie ]	Tyannasour [Tyrannosaur (2012), Peter Mullan (Actor), Olivia Colman (Actor), Paddy Considine (Director)]	Nudity Sexually explicit Violence [Offensive language] Didn't like that the film was violent with a lot of swearing and sex.	Patron	Public	Material retained.	ON	April 30, 2012 May 10, 2012
6	Book/Textbook	Hard and Fast by Sean Wolfe	Sexually explicit	Patron	Public	Material retained.	ON	Received May

4	[adult fiction]	[Sexually-themed short stories featuring gay characters].	[Pornographic] The complainant considered the content to be pornographic and did not think it should be funded by taxpayers' money.	self-identified as gay man who enjoys gay erotica/ pornography		The book was purchased as erotic fiction, which the Library does collect. Pornography is difficult to define but there is consensus that the portrayal of the participants is crucial - characters vs body parts. There was agreement by the review committee that there is character and plot development in the stories, therefore they are erotic fiction. Our collections are built to reflect the diverse and changing interests of our public and the demand for erotic fiction is increasing as it becomes more mainstream (50 Shades of Grey). The book fits within our materials selection policy.		10, 2012. Resolved July 20, 2012.
6 5	Book/Textbook [adult non-fiction]	The Politically Incorrect Guide to Islam and the Crusades by Robert Spencer. [A review of Islamic history and the Qur'an aimed at proving that Islam is not a religion of peace but of conflict. Published by the conservative American press Regnery as part of their "Politically Incorrect" series]	Anti-ethnicity Political viewpoint Religious viewpoint The complainant felt that the book presents a distorted view of Islam and aims to promote Islamophobia. She did not read the whole book and her complaint came from the section on how Islam oppresses women.	Patron	Public	Material retained. The author is a well-known if polemical figure and Regnery Press is an established conservative press. Our policy supports intellectual freedom "... to guarantee and facilitate access to all expressions of knowledge and intellectual activity, including those which some sections of society may consider to be unconventional, unpopular or unacceptable." The complainant also suggested alternate titles on Islam, all of which we have.	ON	November 10, 2012. Resolved January 13, 2013.
6 6	Film/DVD [adult/YA educational]	Date Rape: A Violation of Trust. [an educational DVD that presents information about date rape, what it is and how to prevent it through re-enactments, interviews with actors posing as victims, etc. and real counselors]	Racism The complainant found that the film portrays young black men in an offensive and racist light. The complainant stated that young black men were portrayed negatively, i.e. as one of the rapists and as the angry boyfriend of a rape victim. Furthermore all of the victims were white, sending the message that this was a black on white crime and did not affect black women. All participants were black or white and the video did not reflect the multicultural diversity of [...].	Patron	Public	Material removed. Although the script was even-handed, the impact of the visual images undermined the message. It is not a documentary but an educational video that is meant to be used with groups of students and does not reflect the many racial and ethnic groups that make up Toronto. The lack of any but white victims was a serious flaw. We have been unable to find a video on this important topic that is Canadian made and reflects our diversity but continue to look.	ON	April 5, 2012. Resolved March 26, 2013.
6 7	Film/DVD [adult/not rated movie]	Woyzeck, directed by Werner Herzog, Klaus Kinski (Actor), Eva Mattes (Actor), 1979. A film version of a famous murder case in 1836 involving a soldier killing his mistress in a jealous rage leading to a question about his sanity.	Sexism Violence [Age inappropriate] The complainant found that the video depicts violence towards women both in content and in the DVD's cover art. She was also concerned that a child might see the cover and think that violence towards women is acceptable.	Patron	Public	Material retained. This is a famous story that has been depicted in a number of films and an opera; Herzog is an award-winning director and the film is considered a classic. It does not condone but condemns violence and portrays Woyzeck as a good man driven mad by a doctor's experiments. It also links his poverty to his treatment, anticipating Marx's theories. The DVD is housed in the adult collection making it unlikely that a child would see it.	ON	Feb. 21. Resolved May 6, 2012.
6 8	Film/DVD [family movie/PG]	Coraline [based on a book by Neil Gaiman]	Age inappropriate	Parent/guardian	Public	Material retained. We followed the Ontario Film Board rating (PG). Vancouver, Halifax and Toronto	ON	Feb 7, 2012 Feb 28, 2012

						Libraries had it.		
6 9	Policy	Film rating policy linked to DVD challenge of Coraline	Age inappropriate	Parent/guardian	Public	[Policy retained] We followed the Ontario Film Board rating (PG). Vancouver, Halifax and Toronto Libraries had it.	ON	Feb 7, 2012 Feb 28, 2012
7 0	Book/Textbook [children's non-fiction]	What's Happening to My Body? [subtitle unknown] by Lynda Madaras	Age inappropriate	Patron	Public	Material retained. Checked professional reviews, other library collections.	ON	Apr 4, 2012 Apr 18, 2012
7 1	Book/Textbook [children's picture book]	Mon Petit Lapin by Claire Freedman	Offensive language Age inappropriate Parents noted the casual use of profanity/swearing.	Parent/guardian	Public	Material removed. Text was a French mistranslation of original British text where profanity wasn't used (also, the sense of the text was not translated well).	ON	May 10, 2012 May 18, 2012
7 2	Graphic novel/ Comic/Manga [children's]	Les Voleurs de Yaourts by Emmanuel Guibert [part of the Sardine BD series #4]	Offensive language Age inappropriate Patron felt the sense of humour was more adult - using vulgar plays on words and language.	Patron	Public	Material retained. Checked professional reviews and other library collections (Gatineau, Toronto, Vancouver Public Libraries had it).	ON	Aug 22, 2012 Sept 5, 2012
7 3	Book/Textbook [middle years novel]	Luminaria by Jackie Morris	Hate Author shouldn't be around children/book is hate-based Claims: Author shouldn't be around children//Book littered with grammatical errors and hate-based.	Patron	Public	Material retained. Reviewed the text – didn't find it offensive. Checked professional reviews, which were favourable. No mention of hate.	ON	Nov 1, 2012 Nov 15, 2012